

Sustainability

“Let’s Talk About Water”

Panel Discussion

Marty Dunlap, Shalini Kantayya, Michael Jackson, Heather Cooley, and Melody Leppard

Marty Dunlap: Everyone at that time going, "What's going on here?" So I went to one person. Well, maybe I could go to law school and have more power in terms of bringing, you know, information and influence to the discussion regarding the environment. And at that point after I graduated, I was approached both by Barbara Vlamis from at that time--Butte Environmental Council now AquAlliance, and then John Merz who was involved with the [inaudible]. Well, we know that you could care about the environment, what about water? And so I started participating with their activities where they were trying to bring together a group called the Sac Valley Environmental Water Caucus, where you bring in non-traditional allies, the tribes, the businesses, the educational groups as well as, you know, people who are using the water resources, the farmers and talking about how can we together work on protecting the water from mass transfers coming out of this area.

And so, we know that's progressed and I've learned a lot about water and the different players in the meantime. And so, I would like to see people come together and talk about it and even though litigation is a very important tool. And so I decide to form a group where people who are working on water have-- had shown a leadership role, kind of be tracking. What are the different projects that are coming forward, some of you might have been here earlier and those different projects that are coming out in Northern California that do threaten our ecosystem. And so that we can track those, make sure that we're paying attention to, you know, when the public does have an opportunity to have input what we need to do so that we maintain our standing in terms of if a law suit was to be filed to be able to stop this certain type of project. So anyway, this is a group that meets monthly and we track on these different projects.

The two things that I just want to mention that I think are emerging for me as very important issues and one has to do with the ethics of water, you know, ethics being moral principles by which a group or an individual live by. And so regarding water, what will be the code of ethics governing water activities? Who will be applying these ethics and when will they be applied as projects are presented? And so my first concern is the ethics, but the second part has to do with the attitude, you know, people's attitudes towards water not really valuing it as a very--as you had mentioned that the sacredness, the reverence that we really need to apply towards this finite resource. And so our values are going to be reflected in our attitude and our values will then be reflected in how we make sure our ethics are applied whether it's in law or just by making outcry to different powers that we're trying to move the water in certain ways that might not be best for different ecosystems. So attitude, I think, is very important and I like to see human beings have a more critical appreciation of water as well as how we employ ethics in decisions regarding our water resources.

Shalini Kantayya: Well, I just spoke a lot about how I got into water. I am a very unlikely environmentalist. I live in New York City, my food comes from the bodega, my water runs hot and cold and for a long time I thought, "What can I possibly have to do in the environment?" And, you know, and then the power goes off and you realize you sort of don't live in the machine that even in big cities like New York, that we live in a very fragile ecosystem.

And I think for me--for those of you who are in the lecture that passed, I mean, I actually fell in love with this river in India. I was on a whim, some friends asked me to document this religious festival, I end up living in a tent by the bank of the Ganges for two months and took very many baths and had this very personal relationship with this river.

And for a lot of people, I know a lot of people who talked about being in the Serra Club, a lot of what we fight for comes from what we love. What we love really deeply is actually what we'll fight for, even Brecht has this quote that we don't act not because we don't know; we don't act because we don't feel. So, as a filmmaker, I feel like my job and my journey is to sort of move the heart and try to get people to feel something.

And I think one of the things that I come up against in the western world especially our people--I mean if you talk about--if I did this lecture in India, they're like, "Yeah, and?" you know, like--because it's so much a part of everyday life. If you live in a big high rise in India, you make a decent income, there's still hours in the day where you just don't get water just because there isn't any. And so I think being someone who's sort of come of age between these two worlds, a world which is scarce and knows the preciousness of water and a water that is somewhat abundant but it's dwindling their vast resources. In the scarcity, they sort of have given me this unique perspective.

And in terms of solutions, I'm always thinking about how we just bring this consciousness back to daily living, you know, how we look at this and say, "Well this came from somewhere, how we bring more consciousness into our consumption habits as Americans." So that's part of that and then being a New Yorker, I was just told today that--I haven't verified it yet, someone in the audience told me that we've just extended the moratorium on fracking for two more years. So that to me is really good news, really good news. [applause]

So--and that was a fight, that was a fight, and I think that for me in the United States Hydraulic Frac--my newest film is on energy and on solar power. And for me, we can't talk about this about this--about holding onto our water without talking about the way we make and use energy in this country. And hydraulic fracking--fracturing--hydraulic fracturing or fracking, I think, is one of the biggest threats to our drinking supply and I really don't think it's far off that we can see an American city lose its water supply.

And so, for me, it's how do we get to young people, you know, you guys are all giving us the solutions. So for me it's about how we put this in language that moves your heart and inspires you to act around your values.

Michael Jackson: My name is Mike Jackson, I've been involved in--I'm a lawyer, I'm now a water rights lawyer, I'm now an environmental lawyer. I started out by being a criminal defense lawyer because I had always believed that the poor and the powerless even when they committed crimes were abused in the system that was built for the rich and the powerful. It was a wonderful living for the first 10 years of my legal practice. I let one too many guilty persons get off and decided I wanted to do something else. I left my home in Redding and my practice in Redding and began to look at these small towns in Northern California to see where I wanted to live and what I wanted to do. I was in Quincy, California where I now live. For about 30 minutes before what turned out to be the librarian who walked by discovered that I was following her. I followed her for six months and she married me.

But there wasn't a lot of call for an expert on murder cases in Quincy, California because it's one of the safest places on earth--if you don't get run over by a logging truck. The--so I began to try to figure out what kind of practice I could fashion. While I was busy doing that, I talked to someone who talked about a concept of water from the Sierra to the Sea, a program that we now have in our school system where 5th graders are taken every year as part of their class to follow the water from the Feather River drainage to where it exits in the--underneath the Golden Gate Bridge in San Francisco, and along the way they take a look at what that water does, who uses it, how it's used, and then they arrive in the most glorious city on earth. And that's where the water is supposed to go.

My trip got confused. I followed the water down to a place called the delta and the water went in two directions. One was what we show our 5th graders, what nature engender. The water goes out under the Golden Gate Bridge and from there you can see the magnificent city and all of the wealth that the natural resources of all of California had originally created in San Francisco at a time when, as I always tell my friends in Los Angeles, Los Angeles was a pueblo of about of 1,200 people. San Francisco was a mighty international city, and they laughed and asked why it's in neutral and they went right by it.

But in following the other water, the water went through the delta, and into what the first time I saw it, it was the most disorienting--I can't use another word except ugly--instruction of how modern people have abused the mighty Central Valley River system. I found myself at gigantic pumps, 6, 8 stories tall sucking everything out of the heart of the greatest estuary on the west coast of the Americas. And I followed it a little farther down the San Andreas Fault where they put the California Aqueduct to another place. It's at the bottom of--at the start of the Grapevine going to Los Angeles, a place called the Edmonton Power Plant where they use all of the energy from all of the dams in the Central Valley and the state water project system to lift the Feather River water over the top of the mountain and dump it down the other side. And then it splits off into 29 different directions.

The one I followed went to San Diego because I love San Diego and I was relatively shocked to find out that actually the Feather River ends in a ditch between Tijuana and San Diego and enters the river instead of under the Golden Gate as part of the affluence that evidently is San Diego water in a sewage treatment plant that is on the Mexican side of the border so that lawyers like me who do environmental documents couldn't have stopped that dumping of it into sea. That sort of changed my life and I decided

that I was going to try to see if I could get the fish which I've learned to fish in Redding. And if I can get the fish to be a little healthier, that maybe that would be something I could do with my life.

And so I began to represent fishing groups around California and I ended up--I now represent the California Sportsfishing Protection Alliance at various times, the commercial fishermen at various times, the Fly Fisherman--just anybody who's got a beef with somebody just spoiling a river. It's been a wonderful life, it's not the one I expected and the reason that I think it's nice that we did this is that you understand that life is a journey, it's mostly downhill and gravity is always sucking at it. I started out, I was much taller, much handsomer, much leaner, but gravity got me.

One of the wonderful thing that's happened since I started practicing law in all kinds of places around the state of California, I have a daughter who is now a lawyer, trying to get her into the same kind of work. I am honored to be at this table with these four women. It was not true when I started that I would have been at a table with four women. And so my journey is improved [applause] immensely by the fact that I can sit here with these four amazing women and be the token man. [Laughter]

Heather Cooley: It's a great story. Okay. So, I'm Heather Cooley and I spoke a lot this morning. So, I'll just give you sort of a synopsis of how I got here. I grew up in California. I grew up in Antioch actually which is right along San Joaquin River and so took many trips in through the delta, on the levees, on the river itself. But I wasn't--I actually wasn't engaged in water until I got much older. So, I went to school at Berkeley, was definitely had more of a scientist background, very interested in Biology and in Ecology, and then have started at that time looking into climate change.

This was a number of years ago before it was quite in the public's attention, and I was doing a lot of research at a national lab on trying to understand how carbon recycling through our soils and through our atmosphere and through our trees, but I really got tired of sort of describing a problem. I could see that the problem is huge and so we were going to talk about it this way and we were going to talk about it that way, and wow, this is going to cause another horrible impact over here. And so I just was really frustrated with that and wanted to get into policy.

And so I just had an opportunity. I took a class on water during graduate school and it was fascinating. We read a lot. There's been a lot of wonderful books written about California water from Cadillac Desert to Water and Power which tells the story of Los Angeles. And so, my interest was piqued in that, and then I just had an opportunity to have a job at the Pacific Institute and I really had very, very little water experience, but I was given an opportunity there and it's a wonderful organization. It's a research institute and so my interest in research and in Science I could still sort of pursue that there.

And as I learned more about California water issues, I sort of just got sucked in more and more. I mean it's a fascinating issue. Water is special as all you in this room know. There's policy. There's politics, there's science, there's cultural and spiritual. All of those things are sort of wrapped up in water. And so I've been--just every part of me has been very much intrigued by those issues. I work on water not only in California in trying to understand some of the issues here and some of the potential solutions, but

also working on water around the world and I'm able to sort of look at what are some innovative things that are being done in Singapore, in Australia, in other parts of the world, in the Netherlands, and what can we sort of learn about them? I think in the United States within California especially, we fail to look outside of our world sometimes. And we think we've got it all figured out here, but we don't. There's actually a lot we can learn from what's going on in other places. And we also do a lot of work on issues around water and sanitation in developing countries and trying to come up with, again, focusing on solutions.

So, I sort of stumbled into this, but there's no way I'm leaving it. It's just a really fascinating field and I really recommend for some of the younger people who are trying to figure out kind of what they want to do. There is so much in water. So, it's really an issue that were just starting to scratch the surface of and realizing its importance. And so there's huge opportunities. Historically, I think it was, you know, focused a lot on sort of the engineering side of water and water management, but there are--there's water policy, there's social aspects of it, there's so many different angles that coming on and that I really encourage you to pursue up on.

Melody Leppard: I'm Melody Leppard. I was born in Chico and I grew up going to Bidwell Park every weekend and camping in the redwoods every summer. So, I've always felt very connected to nature. It's always been a passion of mine. Fast forward to high school, I read about climate change but didn't really understand what that was so what I could do was recycling and composting. So, I started doing these things but I just didn't really--it didn't satisfy me, I didn't feel like it was enough. And then when I was--let's say, probably 19, I had a bestfriend who was taking the Sustainability course at Butte College, and he started telling me about what was truly going on that I wasn't hearing from the mainstream media, from my parents or from my elders or peers.

And it broke my heart and I realized like someone should really do something about that. And then I kind of realized that that somebody was me and everyone in this room. So, I decided--at first I wasn't going college 'cause I thought 'Oh college, who cares?' And then I decided to go to Butte College and take the Sustainability Course myself and got my heart broken a lot just from everything I was learning from Mimi's class. I just kind of felt really powerless like, what am I supposed to do? I'm one person, like, what do I do? And I kind of stumbled into becoming a facilitator at Power Shift which trains--they train like I think it was 10,000 people--students on how to be empowered leaders who empower other leaders and so on. And after that, I realized, oh, like teaming up with other people, that's how I get things done.

And from there, after Power Shift, two weeks later, I went to the California Student Sustainability Coalition Spring Convergence, and there is just all like hundreds of beautiful, passionate student leaders who were taking in charge in how to plan, and I was like, "Cool, I'm going to join you." And so I joined their organization and a semester later, I was asked to join their council so there's--from each chapter there's--it's a whole--okay, let me explain, the California Student Sustainability Coalition has chapters on each college. And what they do is they come together in solidarity to work on issues and I was asked to

be the representative from Butte College. After that I was asked to co-facilitate the California Student Sustainability Convergence at Butte College.

And so, I kind of just stumbled into all this, but I'm really glad that I did and I won't stop because I realized that it's my duty as a citizen to participate and not knowing some neutral on a moving plane and I can't just sit back and let this happen especially when my future is at stake, that friend's future is at stake, I had to do something.

[Applause]

Moderator: I think they all bring inspiring stories for how they came to use and what we've like to do now is open it up to have a dialog with everyone here. So, I'll facilitate questions and please ask to anyone or all of the panelists. Anyone who would like to start us off? Okay.

Audience Member: Do any of you have any knowledge of technologies [inaudible] and maybe some of the environmental impacts of these desalinations [inaudible].

Heather Cooley: Sure.

Moderator: And if we could just try and repeat the question. The question is about desalination, just so it's picked up in the microphone so others from the audience can hear.

Heather Cooley: Great, thank you. There have been a lot of work on desalination specially sea water desalination. And in part because there are about 17 or 18 plants proposed along the California coast.

So historically, some of the earliest desalination plants for solar stills essentially and those were obviously use the heat from the sun to evaporate the salt water and then the condensation was collected and the salt and the brine was disposed of. That is a technology that works. It's a technology that doesn't produce a lot of water frankly. It can be used in small sort of isolated areas but not for large urban areas because of the need.

Then after that, there were sort of thermal desalination plants and that's sort of the technology of choice especially in the Middle East. So with those, you're essentially taking salt water and you're boiling it, capturing the condensation, very energy intensive. Again, something used in the Middle East in part because they have very, very little water. They have a lot of cheap energy.

So, the newer technologies that we're using are reverse osmosis. So with those, there's a membrane. Salt water is sort of forced through the membrane. It captures salt on one side and then freshwater on the other. It's a technology that works. We can do it. It's doable, but it's a very expensive technology, very, very energy intensive. It--but it does produce a high quality reliable supply of water but there are marine impacts associated with the brine discharge.

So, you're taking in huge volumes of water from the ocean and you're--so you're killing marine organisms through that process. You're also then--you have a brine that you have to dispose it. Those are disposed back into the ocean. So, you're killing marine organisms there.

That being said there, are a few desalination projects or plants in California that are operating. They're very, very small scale and mostly for industrial purposes, or if there's water too that have been built for municipal purposes. There are a lot of proposals and place to build more.

As I mentioned there are about 17 proposed plants in California. One has recently received all of the permits and is under construction. It's going to produce about 50 million gallons per day. It's cost of about a billion dollars. So, very, very expensive, and so, you know, there are again a lot of proposals out there. Many communities right now have other reserved cheaper alternatives available. And so, there are some sort of--a lot of pushback on the proposals that are put forth.

Audience member: So, to follow up the question, if we had achieved energy source, okay, cheaper for example. Would that change be greater?

Heather Cooley: If--so energy is a huge piece of the cost. Typically about a third--30 percent of the cost is due to energy. If we could find a way to produce cheaper energy that would certainly lower the cost, but it could also lower the cost of some of the alternatives. So, you know, it's important--it's a technology that could be used but it needs to be weighed against all of the other alternatives. So how does it compare to conservation and efficiency conservation? Efficiency is not free but some people think there is a cost to it, but it's a lot less expensive than desalination. Water reuse, again, also tends to be less expensive, capturing storm water, less expensive. So, cheaper energy would certainly help in the cost issue. It may not help in some of the other issues though. And so it's important that we sort of weigh all of the options together to find that solution that's going to work.

Michael Jackson: Yeah. I'd like to take at another approach at this. Before I start, every one of my clients in the environmental movement opposes ocean desal. That's it. I forced an ocean desal plant because it was the only solution that Monterey and Carmel can come up with to try to fix the fact that they're existing riverine water system; one, it was illegal which we proved in court; but two, basically it was driving the steelhead on the central coast into extinction.

And these were people who had as long as they could pump free water out of the underflow of the Carmel River, dried out the river which was okay for steelhead if they could have gotten in Ventana Wilderness. But their dam blocked that access, and it was simply for Clint Eastwood and Arnold Palmer and the boys at the--that own the--basically the golf courses in the area. It was a matter of money. The--but we won the case. They've never gotten in the water right? That--and they were pumping from the underflow of the river. So, they had to stop and the State Board a moratorium law.

The first thing that they decided to do was to enlarge the dam. The people in Monterey and Carmel realized that, "Wow, if they enlarge the dam and we solve the water problem, we're not--we're going to

have all this development." So 70 percent of the people voted against the dam even in the face of we don't have a water supply. Well, we'll use our political power with Arnold Schwarzenegger and Dianne Feinstein, and even Barbara Boxer, and they did. And so for 10 years, there was no growth in Monterey and Carmel which made everybody happy. But the salmon or steelhead were still extinct on the river.

So, they decided that they we're going to try the PUC, the State Board continued to stand up to them in the face of all this political power and they decided they were going to try a relatively small ocean desal plant to attempt to just put enough water into the existing billionaires and millionaires who live there that they could keep their way of life without any growth. The benefit of that is as they begin to think about the inexhaustible supply that were sitting right next to their houses, they began to realize that, "Hey, we can take that dam out," and they're going to. They're--be the largest dam removal project forced by the fact that the technology of desal is so expensive even for them that they don't do a big thing 'cause--then people like me could move in. But they can keep it as the enclave they want but it's an exhaustible supply.

So the question in my mind--and I am somewhat of a heretic in my own community in this regard--is isn't an externality toward the brine problem and the energy problem, the fact that we can always fall back on what we've done to the rivers, just a question.

Heather Cooley: If I can add.

Michael Jackson: Yeah, no--I--

Heather Cooley: I think the--so there is the potential that desalination--sea water desalination can provide an environmental benefit. So what if we can return water to rivers and streams, restore those systems so we're shifting that impact from our rivers into our oceans. That's a real question. I think in the case on Monterey, you actually have a legally enforceable regulation that says, okay, for every gallon of water, you develop of new supply, you have to put back a gallon in that river. And so in that case, there is an environmental benefit and it's on a one to one basis.

Michael Jackson: Great.

Heather Cooley: In other areas, that legal mechanism is not in place and so some may say and some utilities do say this, "Oh, it'll a provide environmental benefit," but they could just be saying that, there's no legal mechanism in place. And so, there is the potential they can provide an environmental benefit but we have to be careful about that to ensure that there's some way that that's actually a key.

Michael Jackson: And so, this is an example of to improve an environmental situation, you need a karat of the knowledge of what can be done. And on both sides of me, I think you have people with the creative ability to do that. But sometimes, it helps to have a stick like Marty and I. We're not going to save the earth, we're going to stop somebody from destroying it and allow these lovely people and you lovely people to save the earth.

Shalini Kantayya: Stop them from destroying it [inaudible]. [Laughter]

Moderator: Go ahead, please.

Audience Member: Is there a way to take the salts we've got, you know, the big pile just salt we get from desalinization and possibly mix it with some other chemicals in a good way to put back into the sea to where it's not harmful? I mean, I don't know that much of chemistry to know if you can do that? [Inaudible Remarks & Laughter]

Heather Cooley: So the question was about the salts that you get out off the brine after you desalinate water, is there something you could do beneficially perhaps with them or if there are some chemical or something you could do to it before putting it back into the ocean like to reduce its impact.

So, there are a lot of people interested in, you know, salt as a resource, there are the other sort of minerals in the brine or there are ways that we can sort of utilize them and there is definitely a group that are interested in that.

The issue especially in California is you would need a fairly large land area to do that and energy because you would need to--it's brine, it's not just dry salts. And so drying that is very energy intensive, it's land intensive and those two things are expensive in California. So, it's probably not likely in California.

There are ways though of reducing the impact of the brine and they have done this specially in Australia. Australia was going through a 13-year drought; they decided to build desalination plants, six of them, six very, very large ones. Today, two of those are in operation, four are going to put in standby mode because they built too many and they built them too big and they didn't need it and there were cheaper alternatives. So, that's something to keep in mind as we think about desalination in California.

But, they did design those very, very well. They're all powered by renewables. They have what are called brine diffusers and they have diffusers at the end of the brine pipeline that mix it into the environment. So there's a small environmental impact but it dissipates quite rapidly. So there are technologies in place to reduce the impacts of brine and it is expensive and that does add to the cost.

So, of course, there are some environmental costs that we're offsetting so we're just sort of internalizing that environmental cost into the cost of desalination but it's possible. But again, we start getting in the cost issues.

Audience Member: Can I just add to that. There was a company in California sequestering CO2 into the brine but because sequestering CO2 is an oil and gas-controlled industry, this small research company couldn't get the funding to promote that. And if, you know, you had desalination I'm opposed to that's an excellent way to create a solution to a couple of problems that we're faced with sequestering CO2 in creating aggregate from that, you know, waste [inaudible].

Moderator: Thanks for that, right here in front. That's you.

Audience member: Salt corrodes everything, how are these desalination plants not going to corrode [inaudible].

Heather Cooley: So they use--interesting agreement of that. And so the question was about the corrosiveness of salt and how these plants are able to deal with it. So, it's interesting you bring that up. There were issues with that in Tampa Bay, so Tampa Bay built a desalination plant, the cheapest plant in the world, and people who were amazed at the cost of it then the cost was so cheap because they cut corners and they put other used materials that could be corroded by salt. And so, that was a problem there, they eventually had to invest only after the private company got out and the public agency took it over. So, that was a problem in that situation. Typically, for the other plants that they're using, they're using a type of steel that doesn't corrode so it solved that issue although if somebody's trying to cut corners, it can be a problem.

Moderator: In the back there, go ahead.

Audience member: I was just wondering how would, in your opinion, how we can get more people involved in water? Sometimes they just cross it off the list if it sounds too complex. And the follow up question is, to make a difference, do they actually need to involve the masses or can just going--

Michael Jackson: Do you want to try that one? [Inaudible Remarks]

Marty Dunlap: Well, one of that ways that I think the public can be involved is actually bringing pressure to bear on the powers that-- but it seems to me that--and what I'm talking about ethics is the way that our ethics are employed in a larger scale is with laws. And I think that right now, to bring about changes with either ground water protection or fracking that it doesn't seem right now that California, that the state level or federal level is going to take on those types of things, so it seems to me that local ordinances are some ways that we can provide some protections for ourselves and people with initiatives do bring some effort into, you know, getting signatures and rally on a county level to bring about change that seems to be more protective. So I think that people can work together in those types of initiatives.

And also in trying to have incentives shifted from some of our short-term solutions and same thing where the public can bring--enforce some type of effort on where projects are funded if they're going to be, you know, using recycled water or conservation projects as opposed to the short and in my mind short term, you know, raising a dam, Shasta Dam, or building sites of reservoir and instead, you know, put it in to efforts that are really long-term solutions. And I think the public can put together those types of initiatives, but they, you know, obviously have to be coordinated by some Grassroots people.

Shalini Kantayya: Just to--just to speak about fracking in New York, I mean, that was a mass movement. The fact that we've even gotten extended for two years this moratorium is a massive thing, and tons of activists and lots of youth and musicians all came out. And so, I think--one important thing, I think, for me is just the stories we're telling, and how we created compelling story. And if the story we're telling isn't reaching this person across the aisle, maybe we need to find a different story that reaches them.

And so, I think part of it is sort of knowing who you're speaking to and knowing what their values are. Is their value of jobs? Is their value this? Is their value, you know. But I do think that this--at least putting it off in New York for two more years is an example that there is a powerful base that is making change. And I think, it's very powerful that we're here for college campus because I think students have an enormous amount of power.

And you were asking whether we can make change locally or globally. I mean, I do find there's always ways of making change globally, but I think particularly with water. Water systems are really local. And I think what touches you, what moves you, why I'm so impassioned about fracking, in particular is because I know that means I could go to my tap one day and have it not be clean. And so, I think there is that immediacy that happens when you're dealing with local, sort of water and water issues.

Michael Jackson: I think there's a local example that needs to be highlighted here. I mean, if you consider 100 miles away local. The governor's idea to build the tunnels underneath the delta to take the fresh water out of the estuary and deliver it to Southern California and the agriculture in the San Joaquin is based upon treatment cost. They basically want pure Sacramento water, they don't want to have to treat it. They would like more quantity, but basically, it's the treatment cost.

The people in between where the water is taken today and whether we--and where the governor wants to take it tomorrow are all kinds of American citizens. You know, there are left wingers and right wingers and religious people and atheists and there're people who love their guns and there are people who are scared of those who love their guns. There are men, women, ethnic groups, it's one of the most ethnically diverse areas on the planet. When you run into a person of Hmong or Minh background speaking Spanish, you understand that the delta is a place absolutely unique.

And so as you begin to see tea party Americans, meeting with--in a room with billionaires, that Hilton Hotel chain, the people who own the San Diego Chargers, the--they're all delta people. And that the languages and the cultural differences have just absolutely disappeared. And these people lining up, neighbor to neighbor, with their three-part program which is you will never be able to write an environmental document. They will withstand our lawyers. If you do, you will never be able to dig under this delta because we won't let you on a property and you can't condemn at all. Number three, if you buy us all out, we will shut you down for fish reasons the next day.

I have never seen an area organized so fast or so hard and they're angry at everybody. They're angry at the environmentalist because we won't stop it. And we point out, "Hey, there's only eight of us, ha ha ha, and you're going to have to help on your own." They're angry at the rich because they won't buy the

politicians to stop it. And, of course, there's not enough rich. They've only got five billionaires in all area. The--and they're angry in particular at the Sacramento Valley people because they won't join the delta people to protect the common area of origin.

And if there's one message that I can give to you is everyone who's looked into it down south in the delta, believes that, I mean, the information is out there down there. When they built the State Water Project, Governor Earl Warren pointed out that there was only half the amount of water that would be necessary to deliver the contracts to Southern California that they signed, and to the west side of San Joaquin. And there is no other river.

One thing I know from the 30 years of work in the water industry is that no one diverge water downstream of their diversion. They're moving north for the extra water and it's about three-million acre feet. And for those of you who saw Barbara Vlamis's examples, there is no question that it's the rice water and the water in the basin in the underground 'cause there's no other river to take it from. And raising Shasta Dam, I grew up in Redding, I don't know where the engineers and the consultants and the lawyers went wrong in their education, but they can do a concrete truck dance for more rain and it ain't going to work. There is no other water.

Moderator: We are going to need to wrap it up in just a minute but I'm interested to hear the past question. Melody, if you could respond, how we can mobilize your generation?

Melody Leppard: Okay. Well, how I see it is that there are three groups of people and this is huge generalization that I shouldn't be doing but I'm doing it. There's the people who just don't care. There's the people who care but aren't doing anything and then there's the people who care and are doing something. And in my experience, it's a more efficient use of time to work on the people who care and doing anything than to try to help the people who are apathetic understand why they should care. And if--the second group is a very large amount of people and if we could mobilize them, if we could empower them, if we could strengthen them, and how they can get a movement started if we can show them that truly have power.

I feel that this is a big issue that people just--they don't know what to do. They don't know how powerful they are. They don't know that when you come together with other people, you can really accomplish something. And I think that we need to work on getting that second group. And if there's any of you in this room, let this be the end of you being in Group 2, and please join us in Group 3 because we need you. [Applause]