



Moderator: Without further due I want to get going with our speakers today. These wonderful women are with an organization in San Francisco called the SAGE Project which stands for Stand Against Global Exploitation. We have Ellyn Bell who is the Director, and Donna Sinar who is the Project Coordinator. And I am going to just let them take over.

Ellyn Bell: As she was saying, I am with, we are with the SAGE Project, I am the Executive Director and Dona Sinar is our Project Coordinator for our human trafficking portion of SAGE. We are going to talk to you more about the programs that we have.

Overview



- About SAGE
- Human Trafficking 101
- Case Scenarios
- Role of Trauma
- Human Trafficking in the Global Human Rights Movement
- Your Part!

Ellyn Bell: So we are going to go ahead get started and kind of give you the overview. And do we have a clicker? Yeah, so, this is about SAGE and about what we are going to be doing today, so, I told you a little bit about our organization, we will be going into a few more details about it in a couple of minutes. So that is going to be the first part of the presentation. Second part, we will be giving you an overview on human trafficking and the issues of human trafficking today, from a sex and labor perspective as well as international and domestic, adults and children. So we will be covering a lot of information in really a short amount of time today but we are going to try to put it all in perspective. So we will start with that human trafficking so everybody can get some good grounding and what that is.

We are going to do a few case scenarios, which will get some of your input. What you think some of the situations, situations that actually occur and then we are going to move, we will take a little sag way into some of the deeper work and that really moves into the role of trauma. We will be talking about aspects of surviving whether the human trafficking or sexual exploitation. And we are going to get into the deeper differences between sexual exploitation. That can also include prostitution, the sex industry, and a whole variety of things that interconnected. But they are not necessarily human trafficking, they may be or they may not be. But we are going to cover all of these and

Overview



- About SAGE
- Human Trafficking 101
- Case Scenarios
- Role of Trauma
- Human Trafficking in the Global Human Rights Movement
- Your Part!

hopefully get in to some, you will be able to see some of the differences, but you will also be able to see how trauma affects people and, how trauma is interwoven throughout all of these forms of exploitation and oppression.

Then we will be talking about human trafficking in the global human rights perspective. So we will kind of go small and then open it up, back to the individual and then to a larger perspective and really the creation that the human rights movement around us is not very well formed. And if some of you were at the film last night, I think you know that the speaker mentioned that we need more of a movement. Well, we had lots of movements in this country around anti-violence, domestic violence, sexual assault, but we really, we make a little bit of head way but we don't always get to where we want to be. And maybe there really is no destination, it really is this journey that we are on, but what does this journey look like from a human rights perspective, and we will be talking about that and your part of course. So that is kind of an overview of the next few hours, if you have to leave and you can come back, great, this is kind of how we will be rolling up today.



Ellyn Bell: We have to show this because we get funded by the Federal Government and we show different partners because we are part of an anti-trafficking collaborative in the Bay area. We love being a part of this, this has made our work so much easier because nobody can do this work alone. And we really have to do it with a synergy of our voices and bringing people together to, not, organizations together that are doing the work on the ground, it is the boots on the ground every day that really make a difference and in this collaborative it is really much of that. So we have Bawar with sexual assault, and SFwar we work with them, Sisters of the Holy Family, they have done a lot of work around this, Alameda county district attorney's office and Newcomers Health Program. And this is just one of the collaborative we are a part of, we are also part of a lot of San Francisco work as well. This is just kind of a cross Bay collaborative that we are working on. It really helps us looking at wide area, a wide span of the Bay area.

Mission Statement



The SAGE Project's mission is to improve the lives of persons who have experienced or are at risk of sexual exploitation, human trafficking, violence and other forms of trauma.

Ellyn Bell: The mission of SAGE, our main mission is to improve the life of persons who have experienced or at risk of sexual exploitation, human trafficking, violence and other forms of trauma. We just reworked our mission about two months ago I think. We used the word prostitution in some of our missions, and it was a staff perspective to take that word out of the mission statement. We also, there was kind of some conflation of some things which will, as we talk a little bit more about, so with the staff and board we decided that we really wanted to take that word out and focus more on what is the whole view, what is the whole overview of what SAGE is about, and so this is what we came up with.



the
SAGE
PROJECT

Norma Hotaling, Founder



Deanne Fitzmaurice / The Chronicle

After overcoming sexual exploitation and drug addictions **Norma Hotaling devoted her life to ending the commercial sex trade in the United States.** While she left behind a life of despair, homelessness, addiction, and prostitution, she used her experiences to educate others about the harms of sex trade **She became a passionate leader** and was often called on to speak at conferences, counsel public policy experts, and testify before the U.S. Congress and state legislatures. She also addressed foreign audiences as a Department of State-funded speaker. – Trafficking In Persons Report, 2009

Ellyn Bell: SAGE was founded in 1992 by Norma Hotaling and she was a survivor of child sexual exploitation. She had been trafficked as a child in the 50's and 60's I would say, before everybody was ever talking about trafficking. So as a result she ended up homeless and addicted to heroin and was victimized in many ways. She suffered poly victimization, many many traumas, wound up in jail and eventually finding her way to wholeness, she started working with young women who were in detention, and with women in jail, who she had known, and they formed a survivor's network, and that survivor's network later became the SAGE Project. And she has, she passed away in 2008, and she has an amazing history, really the first peer led organization in the country to address this. And I remember when SAGE was formed in 1992, I was right out of graduate school living on the East Coast, working in domestic violence, and I remember hearing about the SAGE Project starting up and thinking this is brilliant because it looks at the intersections of violence, and predominantly at the point women's lives, looking at the sexual assault, the long term effect of childhood sexual exploitation, looking at all these interconnections and prostitution in the sex industry, and the trauma that was associated with it. So in a peer model and we will talk a little bit about that as we get deeper into the services, it really takes survivors who are helping other survivors. And that was how SAGE really got its beginning; it was survivors helping other survivors. And still today, our staff is more than half survivors of some form of involvement in



Norma Hotaling, Founder



Deanne Fitzmaurice / The Chronicle

After overcoming sexual exploitation and drug addictions **Norma Hotaling devoted her life to ending the commercial sex trade in the United States.** While she left behind a life of despair, homelessness, addiction, and prostitution, she used her experiences to educate others about the harms of sex trade **She became a passionate leader** and was often called on to speak at conferences, counsel public policy experts, and testify before the U.S. Congress and state legislatures. She also addressed foreign audiences as a Department of State-funded speaker. – Trafficking In Persons Report, 2009

the sex industry.

Also, it is very important to know about Norma, she did work on the early, the legislation in California and TVPA, which is the Federal legislation on trafficking. She addressed Congress, she has done a whole lot with public policy and I feel very fortunate to have followed in her footsteps and then in this last year she did a lot of work with Korea, Sweden, Norway, other countries and helping them establish similar programs and I had the opportunity to go and speak at an organization in Norway in December that she had helped start ten years ago. So it was a great honor, a great honor to follow in this great woman's footsteps. And that is another very key point about a movement. We have to honor the past. And so being able to honor this woman that went before and all these many survivors is a huge part of the way we deliver our services and work.

Trauma Informed Services 	
Programs	Approach
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • SAGE Youth Program • SAGE Trauma and Addiction Recovery Center (STAR) • Early Intervention Prostitution Program (EIPP) • First Offender Prostitution Program (FOPP) • Trafficking (int'l + domestic) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Peer Counseling • Case Management • Mental Health Therapy • Psycho-Social, Life Skills and Processing Groups • Harm-Reduction • Acupuncture and Holistic Healing Services • Restorative Justice • Demand Reduction

Ellyn Bell: This is our trauma informed approach to services. We have all of our programs, we have youth programs for generally twelve to eighteen, we work in custody and out of custody so we work in the detention centers as well as we work with group homes and youth come in who, they may be involved in the foster system or a variety of other systems, but they come to SAGE for programming. We have what is called the Star Center, which is our trauma and recovery center, which is predominantly addictions where we are funded through Behavioral Health Services, we have case managers, clinicians, therapists, again many of whom are survivors who work in the Star Center. And there are groups, as well as the case management and the clinical services.

The early intervention prostitution program is for women who have been arrested generally this is in the eighteen to twenty five year old population although we do have older women as well. And it is part of collaboration, although not funded right now. With the, we are not funded in a very comprehensive way. At one point I think it was, we worked with the DA's office and the San Francisco police department and we do the First Offender Prostitution Program, which is sort of the, parallel program to the Early Intervention Prostitution Program.

Trauma Informed Services 	
Programs	Approach
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • SAGE Youth Program • SAGE Trauma and Addiction Recovery Center (STAR) • Early Intervention Prostitution Program (EIPP) • First Offender Prostitution Program (FOPP) • Trafficking (int'l + domestic) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Peer Counseling • Case Management • Mental Health Therapy • Psycho-Social, Life Skills and Processing Groups • Harm-Reduction • Acupuncture and Holistic Healing Services • Restorative Justice • Demand Reduction

The First Offender Prostitution Program is also known as the John school. Many people have heard about that, it has been, we are one of the oldest ones in the country. It is essentially a restorative justice program to address buyers and we do it every other month at 850 Bryant, which is the Hall of Justice in San Francisco, with the DA's office and the San Francisco police department. So men that have been arrested soliciting sex through an undercover operation then go to the First Offender Prostitution Program. That is where people who have been arrested and charged will then attend, that every other, one class one day and get credit and then they don't a conviction on their record for soliciting sexual services.

The EIPP as I was saying is for women who have been arrested and they have the opportunity to take the charges off their record by coming through the EIPP program and by attending classes, getting case management, getting therapy, and a variety of different services at SAGE. And then we also have what is considered the Mental Health Program, which is part, not part of the Star Center, but similar and in the Mental Health Program anybody who has experienced trauma as a result of any of these things I have previously described can come in through our Mental Health Program and see a therapist. We do EMDR, other, narrative therapy, talk therapy, cognitive behavioral therapies, and all of these programs are part of our adult services,

Trauma Informed Services 	
Programs	Approach
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • SAGE Youth Program • SAGE Trauma and Addiction Recovery Center (STAR) • Early Intervention Prostitution Program (EIPP) • First Offender Prostitution Program (FOPP) • Trafficking (int'l + domestic) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Peer Counseling • Case Management • Mental Health Therapy • Psycho-Social, Life Skills and Processing Groups • Harm-Reduction • Acupuncture and Holistic Healing Services • Restorative Justice • Demand Reduction

and part of these programs comes, hum, a key component of these programs is also the holistic healing. So we also have acupuncture, massage therapy, art therapies, and trying to have movement therapies and things like that. So all of these Star, Mental Health, EIPP all have that available to them. FOPP is very separate because as I mentioned it is with, at the Hall of Justice every other month.

Some of our approach again is peer counseling, case management, mental health therapy, we have psychosocial life skills, processing groups, we function on a harm reduction philosophy. Is everybody familiar with harm reduction, anybody not?

Audience member: No.

Ellyn Bell: Ok. Harm reduction is essentially what we, when somebody comes in and they are involved in the sex industry and they say, hum, you know, I am involved, I am doing X Y Z, we do not say you have stop this. We actually help people decide what we can do to help them make a decision to exit if this is what they want to do, or to cut back. Same thing with alcohol, we do not say stop, go to an abstinence group, you can no longer drink, you can no longer use drugs, but we do practice harm reduction and that person then has to decide for themselves what works in terms of cutting back. So if you are working in the sex industry it may very well be that you just make sure that

Trauma Informed Services 	
Programs	Approach
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • SAGE Youth Program • SAGE Trauma and Addiction Recovery Center (STAR) • Early Intervention Prostitution Program (EIPP) • First Offender Prostitution Program (FOPP) • Trafficking (int'l + domestic) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Peer Counseling • Case Management • Mental Health Therapy • Psycho-Social, Life Skills and Processing Groups • Harm-Reduction • Acupuncture and Holistic Healing Services • Restorative Justice • Demand Reduction

there is always a condom available, that you are never getting into a car without one. Or you may decide that you have cut back to drinking only two times a day or once a week, or you know what, it is a cutting back method, it really is about practicing, reducing the harm to you and you have to decide what that looks like. Each individual would have to decide what that would be for them.

So and, acupuncture and holistic healing often helps with this because we do the ear acupuncture, detox, helping people to clean out their system, choose healthier lifestyles, and harm reduction is definitely a part of that. Restorative justice is another piece and that is part of the FOPP, again helping people to wake up to the facts of their actions, and that is what we do with the First Offender Prostitution Program, it is not a shaming program. We try to help people look at the consequences of their actions, and what it is another human being as an object. And then again demand reduction. That is also another piece of the, of all the work, it is trying to reduce the demand for buying and selling human beings.

The SAGE PROJECT

Approach Cont.

The SAGE Project also seeks to affect larger societal change through advocacy and training, public awareness and providing the tools needed to engage the local, national, and international communities around issues of sexual exploitation, human trafficking and trauma.

Ellyn Bell: Our overall, kind of larger global perspective is that we seek to affect a larger societal change through advocacy and training. We do a lot of that around the area and the country through public awareness and providing the tools needed to engage the local, national, international communities. And again with the work that Norma began years ago, we have continued that in our work, in our partnerships, helping other organizations form throughout the country. Many organizations have formed to be similar to SAGE, again our overall view being that we are from the ground up, and that social change only occurs when it occurs on the ground and that informs what happens in a larger context. And we firmly believe that, so our approach is rooted in services to the individuals, services to the community, we hope that by rooting ourselves in that, we help people change their own lives and therefore when they change their lives they are able to help change the lives within their community and then that is how we see social change occurring. And that what we see as our role, never a top down approach, never we tell you how to do it, that what needs to happen in order for a person or an individual to change, for a community to change, for an issue to be addressed, has to begin on the ground. So that is essentially how we see our approach.



What is Human Trafficking?

Action + Means + Purpose

OR

Recruits	Force	Sex
Harbors	Fraud	Labor
Transports	Coercion	
Provides	Abduction	
Obtains	Manipulation	

Ellyn Bell: And I am going to let Donna start speaking now, she is, we are going to move a little bit more into the human trafficking piece and some of our scenarios.

Donna Sinar: Great, thanks. Hi, I am Donna, I am the Program Manager of the traffic component at SAGE and I wanted to quickly thank you for making this an important issue. Thank you for focusing on human trafficking it is an important issue and we need you to be our partners and, reaching victims of trafficking. Okay, so, what is this human trafficking that we are talking about? Does anyone have an idea? I think some people do. Does anyone try for the definition? Sure.

Audience member: How about the buying and selling of people?

Donna Sinar: Yeah, that is very basic and essentially, yes. Right. Anyone want to add to that? Go ahead.

Audience Member: [inaudible]



What is Human Trafficking?

Action + Means + Purpose

OR

Recruits	Force	Sex
Harbors	Fraud	Labor
Transports	Coercion	
Provides	Abduction	
Obtains	Manipulation	

Donna Sinar: Yes, absolutely. You guys are hitting it on the mark. There is a federal definition for human trafficking and it is very long, it is defined as the Trafficking Victims Protection Act which was passed in the year 2000 and actually most recently passed this month on March 7th, the Trafficking Victims Protection Reauthorization Act which just enhanced the federal law. As we learn more about trafficking we are enhancing our laws to reflect the tools that we need to catch trafficker as well as the services that are needed for victims. So there is a very long definition but I am going to tell you how I think of it and you guys captured it, and then I also have this chart that helps me walk through it.

So in simple terms, I think that as, when one person overcomes another person's will through force, fraud, or coercion, for the purpose of sex or labor for profit. Another way to look at it is through this chart, and we have an actions column, a means column, means column and a purpose column. And you need one item from each column. So if you go from one of the actions, one person does to another person. One person recruits another person, or harbors, or transports another person or provides or obtains another person, notice that transport is only one of the items so I think that frequently we think of human trafficking it might be someone from abroad, crossing in our national borders and trafficked into the U.S. That does happen and that is human



What is Human Trafficking?

Action + Means + Purpose

OR

Recruits	Force	Sex
Harbors	Fraud	Labor
Transports	Coercion	
Provides	Abduction	
Obtains	Manipulation	

trafficking, but the movement is not required for it to be trafficking. We have trafficking here in the U.S. of U.S. citizens and sometimes with no movement, again with little movement involved. It could be one person being trafficked from a neighborhood, in, in an apartment and there actually not much movement, it is not required.

The means would be through force, fraud, coercion, abduction or manipulation, again it is only one of these items that needs to be present in order for it to be trafficking. Examples of force would be violence, physical violence, rape, and isolation, confinement. And examples of fraud would be false promises, promises of a better life or promises of just a different type of work, promises of love and affection and glamour. And coercion, coercion would be a type of psychological manipulation, that, it can look differently in different cases but one example would be, do this for me if you love me, or you need to do this for me, sorry or, you owe me debt, you need to pay this debt off and you have nowhere to go because you are here illegally and if you go to the authorities they are not going to do anything, they will deport you because you are here illegally. That is in fact not true, under the Trafficking Victims Protection Act that is what the act created, illegal status for victims. Victims of human trafficking that meet the level of this definition actually have the ability to have a legal status here through something called the T-Visa, the trafficking



What is Human Trafficking?

Action + Means + Purpose

OR

Recruits	Force	Sex
Harbors	Fraud	Labor
Transports	Coercion	
Provides	Abduction	
Obtains	Manipulation	

visa, which allows a person to stay in this country for 4 years, and after 4 years that person can apply for a green card and then citizenship, so become a U.S. citizen eventually.

And for the purpose of sex or labor for profit, and we will get into different examples of commercial sex as well as labor trafficking, but you walk through this, you take one of the options, one of the means, and one of the purpose, purposes, for profit. So for example, one person recruited another person by forcing them, violently forcing them to enter the sex industry, into commercial sex, that would be human trafficking. Is this making sense? Okay. Great, yes. And what about domestic minor sex, is there a question? Yes? Go ahead.

Audience member: [inaudible]

Donna Sinar: Yes, yes there is a cap on T-visas and I believe it is 5000 but it might be a little less. However, the, that is a great question, there is a cap but we have never, ever, reached it since T-visas have been available for trafficking victims. Since the year 2000 we have never, we have not distributed 5000, and that, I think 5000 is the annual cap. So that is a really good question. I think we are getting into it more, why aren't more people coming



What is Human Trafficking?

Action + Means + Purpose

OR

Recruits	Force	Sex
Harbors	Fraud	Labor
Transports	Coercion	
Provides	Abduction	
Obtains	Manipulation	

forward? And why aren't more T-visas made available for victims? There is definitely some issues there. Sure. Okay. And what about domestic minor sex trafficking? I think that this is getting more media attention; we are recognizing it as trafficking when before we may not have seen it in this way. How the, how the federal government, federal definition of domestic minor sex trafficking which is also defined in the federal law.



What is Domestic Minor Sex Trafficking?

Action + Means + Purpose

OR

Recruits	Force	Sex
Harbors	Fraud	Labor
Transports	Coercion	
Provides	Abduction	
Obtains	Manipulation	

Donna Sinar: It defines it, you don't, if we are talking about someone under the age of eighteen, you do not have to prove any of these. Any of the means, you do not have to prove that there is force, fraud, coercion, manipulation, more often than not, I mean in a very high percentage, there are those elements but it is not necessary to prove it. The mere fact that a child is in the sex industry by definition makes them a victim of human trafficking, and the idea behind that is that a child cannot consent to their own sexual abuse. And I want to make clear that this is only true for sex trafficking, domestic minor sex trafficking, not labor. So if a minor is trafficked for labor, you do have to prove the force, fraud, and coercion.



Where does Trafficking Occur?

Sex Trafficking	Labor Trafficking
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Commercial Sex: massage parlors, brothels, strip clubs, night clubs, escort services, internet, sex tours, street prostitution, pornography, hotels, truck stops, cantinas, gangs • Servile marriage • Survival sex • <i>Anyone under the age of 18 in the sex industry</i> 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Service industries • Domestic servitude, “nannies” • Construction • Agricultural work • Janitorial, • Assisted care facilities • Panhandling, salesclerks • Gangs

Donna Sinar: So where do we see sex trafficking? I will talk about sex and labor, but sex trafficking. Commercial sex we see, sex trafficking in massage parlors, sorry, massage parlors, brothels, strip clubs, escort services, we see it on the internet, but that is also where we do not see it, it is anonymous so at least purchasers can remain anonymous, and we see on sex tours, street prostitution where it is visible, in pornography, in hotels in truck stops around the country, where traffickers take girls on circuits throughout the country or along the West Coast, there are different tracks. In cantinas, these are bars that women are trafficked to work at and there are both the women that have been trafficked to work at these cantinas are forced to work as bar tenders, so that is labor trafficking. However, frequently they often experience either sexual assault, sexual abuse, or forced also to sell their bodies so it is a combination of sex and labor trafficking.

And gangs we see that gangs use the same methods as traffickers, in the recruiting and the grooming process, so, bringing in young girls and boys, having an initiation process, it is very violent, beatings, gang rape and then forcing girls to sell their bodies and bring the profits back to the gangs, as well as sell drugs or being involved in other criminal activity, such as theft or using counterfeit money and bringing back these profits to the gang. And boys being forced to sell drugs. Servile marriage is another form of sex trafficking that we



Where does Trafficking Occur?

Sex Trafficking	Labor Trafficking
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Commercial Sex: massage parlors, brothels, strip clubs, night clubs, escort services, internet, sex tours, street prostitution, pornography, hotels, truck stops, cantinas, gangs • Servile marriage • Survival sex • <i>Anyone under the age of 18 in the sex industry</i> 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Service industries • Domestic servitude, “nannies” • Construction • Agricultural work • Janitorial, • Assisted care facilities • Panhandling, salesclerks • Gangs

have seen here, and so servile marriage or mail order brides, where a woman enters a contract with a U.S. citizen and she agrees to be someone's spouse, and she comes here and what she had agreed, it is not actually what, what is actually happening. Often times in, I am not saying this about all mail order brides scenarios, but this is what it could be or someone could be vulnerable to, we have seen cases where they are forced to do all of the work in the house so really, that is domestic servitude, and then also, forced to, forced to have sex with the husband, but be more of a sex slave. So the concept of survival sex, survival sex is the exchange of sex for anything of commercial value. So that would be the exchange of sex for something like food, or a place to stay, so shelter, for sometimes for drugs, for clothing or for anything of commercial value. And we see that this is common among runaway homeless youth, that they are exchanging sex to survive. And so when it is someone under the age of eighteen it is absolutely human trafficking.

Ellyn Bell: And just a couple more.

Donna Sinar: Yes.

Ellyn Bell: And just a couple more words on the survival sex. I think this really



Where does Trafficking Occur?

Sex Trafficking	Labor Trafficking
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Commercial Sex: massage parlors, brothels, strip clubs, night clubs, escort services, internet, sex tours, street prostitution, pornography, hotels, truck stops, cantinas, gangs • Servile marriage • Survival sex • <i>Anyone under the age of 18 in the sex industry</i> 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Service industries • Domestic servitude, “nannies” • Construction • Agricultural work • Janitorial, • Assisted care facilities • Panhandling, salesclerks • Gangs

cannot stressed enough especially when talking to college age youth that, runaway homeless youth, systems youth, youth you may see on the street or come in contact with, maybe kids who have drug addicted parents or just no, maybe not the necessary home structure where they are feeling safe and secure. This is a huge piece with runaway homeless youth. You see a lot of this with youth that have been in the system, in the foster care system, prior coming to SAGE I was the Executive Director of Wind Youth Services in Sacramento and we worked with runaway homeless youth and I would say 95% of our youth were involved, or 95% of our girls had been sexually exploited, had been pimped up by other girls, had been pimped up by a boyfriend or were exchanging sex for a place to stay, it was completely common. And boys too, many many boys and this was especially happening a lot.

We worked with the LGBT center in Sacramento and it was just kind of a common occurrence for men trolling around the streets, picking up boys, in certain neighborhoods, so it is high, high, incidences of this. And the important about survival sex is that it is not reported. And a lot of times, the kids are not even thinking anything bad is happening to them. And in other times I have seen girls coming to a youth shelter and they are dressed in their girl clothes, in their jeans and they are, and then in their backpacks they have a pair of high heels and some costumes essentially that they are going to put on later.



Where does Trafficking Occur?

Sex Trafficking	Labor Trafficking
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Commercial Sex: massage parlors, brothels, strip clubs, night clubs, escort services, internet, sex tours, street prostitution, pornography, hotels, truck stops, cantinas, gangs • Servile marriage • Survival sex • <i>Anyone under the age of 18 in the sex industry</i> 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Service industries • Domestic servitude, “nannies” • Construction • Agricultural work • Janitorial, • Assisted care facilities • Panhandling, salesclerks • Gangs

And this also happens with like the children we see in these homes, you see this a lot, girls recruiting other girls, you see boys recruiting other boys, so there are high incidences of this and I think what is really important when we talk about this is that this, these are very very underreported numbers. And we will talk a little bit more about why there are so few cases prosecuted, but that is, this is happening all around us and we do not always see it, and we do not always call it for what it is.

Donna Sinar: I also wanted to add for runaway homeless youth the numbers for LGBTQ youth that run away from home, they are higher than non LGBTQ youth because there is lot of acceptance at home, I mean there are many reasons that children run away from home, not being accepted as a LGBT youth. LGBTQ youth is one of the reasons we see a higher rate of LGBTQ youth engaging, that runaway homeless youth are engaging in survival sex.

Moving on to labor trafficking. Where do we see labor trafficking? We see labor trafficking in the service industry, something really across the board where there is a demand for cheaper, free labor, we see trafficking, people are vulnerable to it. So that would be in the restaurant industry, kind of in the back of the house, back of the house, dishwashing, bussing, cleaning as well as the front of the house with staff, or cooking, we have seen it in construction. In construction, in building, in the garment industry, there was a big case in



Where does Trafficking Occur?

Sex Trafficking	Labor Trafficking
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Commercial Sex: massage parlors, brothels, strip clubs, night clubs, escort services, internet, sex tours, street prostitution, pornography, hotels, truck stops, cantinas, gangs • Servile marriage • Survival sex • <i>Anyone under the age of 18 in the sex industry</i> 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Service industries • Domestic servitude, “nannies” • Construction • Agricultural work • Janitorial, • Assisted care facilities • Panhandling, salesclerks • Gangs

American Samoa in the garment industry where 400, it was not 400, but hundreds of people from Thailand were trafficked to work in the garment industry in American Samoa that was one of the first largest cases, labor trafficking cases.

There is another, really large trafficking case that just was in court, it is called the Global Horizons case and that actually took place all over the U.S., the continental U.S., and Hawaii as well, and there was people who were actually brought over from Thailand as well, and they were forced to work on farms, on coffee farms, banana farms, they were told that they were going to get fair pay, they were not paid at all, they were living in sub-human conditions, they actually had to pay off a debt, and also their documents were confiscated, so they had nowhere to run, they had no identity, and also lack of language, they were isolated. And this was happening, in Hawaii, in Washington State, in Florida, in Kansas, I believe as well, in the South, so these people were trafficked by a company to work in various farms around the country.

So those are examples of the larger pieces but labor trafficking as well as sex trafficking there are small networks and there are large networks, they are big companies that have trafficked individuals, have trafficked large groups of people and there is also individuals that have trafficked other individuals or couples that have, trafficked individuals or families or smaller networks. We



Where does Trafficking Occur?

Sex Trafficking	Labor Trafficking
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Commercial Sex: massage parlors, brothels, strip clubs, night clubs, escort services, internet, sex tours, street prostitution, pornography, hotels, truck stops, cantinas, gangs • Servile marriage • Survival sex • <i>Anyone under the age of 18 in the sex industry</i> 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Service industries • Domestic servitude, “nannies” • Construction • Agricultural work • Janitorial, • Assisted care facilities • Panhandling, salesclerks • Gangs

see individuals or couples or smaller networks trafficking individuals into domestic servitude and what that is, is working inside the home doing all of the house work, the cleaning, the laundry, the childcare, everything that takes place in running a household is done by this person, forced, this person, sorry, this person agreed to come to the U.S. They have agreed to do this kind of domestic work but never signed up to be working 16, 18, 20 hours days, be treated and humiliated, treated like less than a human.

We, hum, some examples of the type of abuse, or the type of, kind of humiliation that individuals have suffered is being made to sleep in a closet, being made to sleep on the floor, or being made to, or food rationing is something that we have seen more than one time, where a person is only allowed a, this small amount of meat and that is going to be their portion for the day. And, let's see, and so like I said, we have seen in agricultural work, we see this here in California, we see in the central valley, we see it up North, you know, we see it in Napa, like I said before, the, where there is demand for cheap labor there is a possibility for exploitation.

The other thing actually I wanted to mention about domestic servitude, like I said before, where individuals that have been trafficked into someone's home that is behind closed doors, that is less obvious, it is harder to reach that population. They are victims of labor trafficking and frequently when women



Where does Trafficking Occur?

Sex Trafficking	Labor Trafficking
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Commercial Sex: massage parlors, brothels, strip clubs, night clubs, escort services, internet, sex tours, street prostitution, pornography, hotels, truck stops, cantinas, gangs • Servile marriage • Survival sex • <i>Anyone under the age of 18 in the sex industry</i> 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Service industries • Domestic servitude, “nannies” • Construction • Agricultural work • Janitorial, • Assisted care facilities • Panhandling, salesclerks • Gangs

are trafficked into domestic servitude we have, they have also been victims of sexual assaults and sexual abuse. So that is, that is, that is labor trafficking, with the sexual abuse, not necessarily sex trafficking, but that, that is frequent and we see that once one person is being vulnerable and exploited, and exploited in one way, it opens up the, this room for more and more exploitation. You know, once the boundary, once the line has been blurred there is, like I said before the poly traumatization, the several different kinds of abuse.

Another example of labor trafficking, we have seen a case with an assisted care facilities, people trafficked from the Philippines to work in assisted living facilities and these people are, keep in mind that many people that have been victims of trafficking, they may have come illegally, they may have had a work visa to come here, that was the case in the Global Horizons case, that they actually had work visas to come over here. They were promised three years visas, they actually, their visas expired shortly after they arrived and that was another vulnerability for them, and also, in this assisted living facility case, people come here with the, legally, with the correct visas, and they agree to do, to work in the assisted living facility, however, once they arrive they are forced to work very long hours, they are forced to pay off their debt to the people that brought them over here, and the amount just keeps adding up because the amount of where they live, the traffickers, expenses like food, the



Where does Trafficking Occur?

Sex Trafficking	Labor Trafficking
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Commercial Sex: massage parlors, brothels, strip clubs, night clubs, escort services, internet, sex tours, street prostitution, pornography, hotels, truck stops, cantinas, gangs • Servile marriage • Survival sex • <i>Anyone under the age of 18 in the sex industry</i> 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Service industries • Domestic servitude, “nannies” • Construction • Agricultural work • Janitorial, • Assisted care facilities • Panhandling, salesclerks • Gangs

flight, the visa, just the number keeps on rising and the more they work they still have, still have not worked off the debt. And so what makes the trafficking is that these individuals are forced to work in this particular place, they do not have the option to work in a different, in a different place, they are not free to come and go, so they, they cannot pay off they debt through another job. These individuals are eating, sleeping, living, in the same place that they work, which is not normal, and are closely watched, not able to leave the premises, or not able to leave the premises without being escorted. That is what makes it trafficking, that they are not free to come and go, or choose where they work. They are being forced to work, so paying off a debt is normal, or I mean paying off a debt is a legitimate, who does not have debt, so but being able to choose where you work to pay off that debt is your right. So if that right has been stripped from you, that is potentially human trafficking. I talked about gangs and, do you want to add?

Ellyn Bell: Yes, I think something also about that piece about the debt, I think that, you know, as Donna said, everybody has debt, but when your debt continually increases, and there is no legal means, sorry, you feel that you have no legal means going against that, or you are unable to make choices around where you work or where you live, these labor trafficking cases are very tricky and it is also very dangerous often times for those who have been trafficked because they feel that if they speak up or talk to someone they may be killed, that their families may be killed.



Where does Trafficking Occur?

Sex Trafficking	Labor Trafficking
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Commercial Sex: massage parlors, brothels, strip clubs, night clubs, escort services, internet, sex tours, street prostitution, pornography, hotels, truck stops, cantinas, gangs • Servile marriage • Survival sex • <i>Anyone under the age of 18 in the sex industry</i> 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Service industries • Domestic servitude, “nannies” • Construction • Agricultural work • Janitorial, • Assisted care facilities • Panhandling, salescrews • Gangs

There was a young man, who, we worked with several years ago who had been labor trafficked into a restaurant at the age of 17 and he had come from Central America and he was in the United States and working with several other youth. They willingly came, they were brought up here willingly because they believed they would have, they would be making money that they could send home and of course that did not happen. And they ended being here, being fearful for their families if they spoke out. In this panhandling, salescrews this is another place where they, with the runaway homeless youth I think it is dangerous. Lot of times that they are trafficked in the sense that oh, come with this group of people and we are going to sell some magazines, or we are going to be selling, selling things door to door, so, it is just kind of, trafficking can happen in multiple situations, and you have the definition now, you know, knowing how people are pulled into this, how easy for a vulnerable person to be essentially tricked or manipulated into being in situation where all of the sudden their rights are stripped away. It can happen very easily and especially with a lot of youth and vulnerable young adults or people who are in systems of poverty, it becomes very difficult. And Donna did mention gangs. That is another means where we get into the labor trafficking. And I think that we are going to move into a, a case study, that Donna can you go ahead and present, this is a sense, you know, maybe just give them the overview and kind of talk about our case study. And this is, we are talking to the labor, please.

Case Study: ASSEFA



Assefa was brought over to the United States from Ethiopia at the age of 15 by a family friend named Kelile. Kelile was a professor of philosophy at a local university.

Assefa was told that she would make \$250 a month, and she could send \$100 of that back to her family. She would live with Mani's family, clean his house and administer medicine



to his sick mother, Debbie. Kelile promised Assefa's parents that Assefa would get a good U.S. education, she would learn to drive, and by her 18th birthday, she would be free to either come back to Ethiopia or pursue college with their support.

Donna Sinar: Yes, so, throughout this presentation we covered it with different case scenarios, just to really get the picture of what we are talking about aside from giving definitions we really want to illustrate what we are talking about. And actually, can I get a volunteer to read?

Audience member: Assefa was brought over to the United States from Ethiopia at the age of 15 by a parent's friend named Kelile. Kelile was a professor of philosophy at a local university. Assafa was told that she would make \$250 a month and she could send \$100 of that money home. She would live with Mani's family, clean his house, and administer medicine to his sick mother, Debbie. Kelile promised Assefa's parents that their daughter would get a good U.S. education, she would learn to drive and on her 18th birthday she would either agree to come back to Ethiopia or pursue college with their support.



Kelile said he owed a debt to Assefa grandfather, who had helped him in the past when his family had been in trouble during the civil war. As the oldest out of 4 children, Assefa was excited that she could help her parents financially, as they were very poor.

Even though Assefa was only 15 years old, Kelile gave her papers to sign saying that she was actually 18 years old. Assefa, only have completed the fifth grade and unable to read English, signed the papers. Kelile then told Assefa to have sex with an older man who would complete her documents. Kelile claimed that he had spoken with her father and that he agreed to the arrangement.

Audience member: Kelile said he owed a debt to Assefa grandfather, who had helped him in the past when his family had been in trouble during the civil war. As the oldest of four children Assefa was excited that she could help her parents financially, as they were very poor. Even though Assefa was only 15 years old, Kelile gave her papers to sign saying that she was actually 18 years old. Assefa, only have completed the fifth grade and unable to read English, signed the papers. Kelile then told Assefa to have sex with an older man who would complete her documents. Kelile claimed that he had spoken with her father and that he agreed to the arrangement.



Kelile slapped her in the face and told her to get in the room. It was the first time she ever had sex and it was very painful. Afterwards, Kelile told her if she ever talked about this incident, that he would throw her and her family in jail. Assefa knew that Kelile was well connected with the police and felt certain that he could carry through with his threat.

A month into Assefa's arrival, Debbie's attitude towards Assefa changed. Assefa asked when she could start school. Debbie refused and said that Assefa was never to leave the house. She said outside were a lot of bad people who would kidnap her and immigration police who will send her back to Ethiopia since the American immigration police liked to question anyone who looked African. Assefa was never sent to school and never taught how to drive.

Audience member: Kelile slapped her in the face and told her to get in the room. It was the first time she ever had sex and it was very painful. Afterwards, Kelile told her if she ever talked about this incident, that he would throw her and her family in jail. Assefa knew that Kelile was well connected with the police and felt certain that he could carry through this threat.

A month into Assefa's arrival, Debbie's attitude towards Assefa changed. Assefa asked when she could start school. Debbie refused and said the Assefa was never to leave the house. She said outside were a lot of bad people who would kidnap her and immigration police who will send her back to Ethiopia since the American immigration police liked to question anyone who looked African. Assefa was never sent to school and never taught how to drive.



Instead, Assefa was forced to wash the marble floors of both levels of the house, wash cars, wash clothing, take care of Kelile’s two minor children—any and all housework one could imagine. She was only allowed to call her family once a month, on speakerphone with Debbie present.

One day, Assefa broke a family heirloom. Enraged, Debbie grabbed the broomstick Assefa was holding and began to beat her. From that point forward, she was told that the heirloom had to be repaid along with the rent that Assefa owed for having lived there for the past 8 months. Debbie began to dock Assefa’s pay more and more until Assefa was only getting \$50 a month that Debbie said she was sending home directly to Assefa’s family.

Audience member: Instead, Assefa was forced to wash the marble floors of both levels of the house, wash cars, wash clothing, take care of Kelile’s two minor children—any and all housework one could imagine. She was only allowed to call her family once a month, on speakerphone with Debbie present.

One day, Assefa broke a family heirloom. Enraged, Debbie grabbed the broomstick Assefa was holding and began to beat her. From that point forward, she was told that the heirloom had to be repaid along with the rent that Assefa owed for having lived there for the past 8 months. Debbie began to dock Assefa’s pay more and more until Assefa was only getting \$50 a month that Debbie said she was sending home directly to Assefa’s family.



Almost three years into her living situation, a friend of Kelile came to visit and stay with the family. Assefa was also required to look after him. One night, Assefa woke up to Kelile's friend on top of her. Kelile's friend touched her inappropriately, but when Assefa screamed, he left her room. Kelile came into her room afterwards and slapped and kicked her for making a fuss for his friend when he just wanted to have some fun. That night, Assefa tried to commit suicide by eating a bottle of Debbie's blood pressure pills. At the hospital, the workers tried to ask Assefa what had happened to her.

Audience member: Almost three years into her living situation, a friend of Kelile came to visit and stay with the family. Assefa was also required to look after him. One night, Assefa woke up to Kelile's friend on top of her. Kelile's friend touched her inappropriately, but when Assefa screamed, he left her room. Kelile came into her room afterwards and slapped and kicked her for making a fuss for his friend when he just wanted to have some fun. That night, Assefa tried to commit suicide by eating a bottle of Debbie's blood pressure pills. At the hospital, the workers tried to ask Assefa what had happened to her.



Trends: International Human Trafficking

- **27 mil people** enslaved globally (Free the Slaves), **10 mil children**; **1.2 mil children** annually. (UNICEF)
- **\$32 bil** in annual profit for traffickers
(Kara, Siddharth. *Sex Trafficking: Inside the Business of Modern Slavery*, 2009).
- **80% women, 50% children** (TIP Report 2007)
- Source Countries: **Africa, Asia, India, Latin America, Eastern Europe, Russia and Canada.**
 - no country exempt
 - SAGE works with 30 – 60 int'l clients / year

Donna Sinar: Thank you, all right. So is this, is this human trafficking yes or no? Yes, and which type of trafficking? Both? Why do you say both?

Audience member: She was forced to have sex against her will and she forced to be a laborer, was not allowed to leave the house and earn her wages for her work.

Donna Sinar: Okay, okay, you said that she was forced to have sex against her will and was forced to work at the house for little or no pay.

Audience member: And was not allowed to leave the house.

Donna Sinar: And was not allowed to leave the house, yes. Okay, so, yes it is labor trafficking, but it is, the question about sex trafficking, it is confusing because she was forced to have sex against her will, however, the piece about having sex or commercial sex for profit is, that part is required for it to be sex trafficking. So while the, she was forced to have sex with the person that was creating the documents, that was part, that was for, to go, that was part of the scheme, part of the labor trafficking scheme, and so if, Kelile had forced Assefa to have sex with the person and then received money from the person,



Trends: International Human Trafficking

- **27 mil people** enslaved globally (Free the Slaves), **10 mil children**; **1.2 mil children** annually. (UNICEF)
- **\$32 bil** in annual profit for traffickers
(Kara, Siddharth. *Sex Trafficking: Inside the Business of Modern Slavery*, 2009).
- **80% women, 50% children** (TIP Report 2007)
- Source Countries: **Africa, Asia, India, Latin America, Eastern Europe, Russia and Canada.**
 - no country exempt
 - SAGE works with 30 – 60 int'l clients / year

that would be sex trafficking. But because there was not money, yes there was the, there was an exchange for the documents, but because it was part of a larger scheme it is, it is labor trafficking with rape. So, it is a little, it gets confusing, but like I has mentioned before that, with labor trafficking, sometimes there is a combination of labor and sex trafficking. Frequently, when women are trafficked for labor purposes there is a, they are vulnerable to sexual assault and sexual abuse. Yes, and.

What are the moments of force, fraud, and coercion from that example? Where there, what could you? Was there force?

That she was forced to have sex, she was forced to work. She was told that, the fraud, she was told that she would be able to learn how to drive, go to school here, that did not happen. Coercion, she was told that her father agreed to the arrangements and knew what was going on. She was told that outside the immigration police would catch, and they do not like African people, so she was told these lies to keep in the house, to keep her under control.

Sure.

Ellyn Bell: And I think with that scenario, I mean that seems like, I hope everybody can see the multiple traumas that this person experienced. These are not uncommon, one trauma, then another. A promise, a promise broken, a



Trends: International Human Trafficking

- **27 mil people** enslaved globally (Free the Slaves), **10 mil children**; **1.2 mil children** annually. (UNICEF)
- **\$32 bil** in annual profit for traffickers
(Kara, Siddharth. *Sex Trafficking: Inside the Business of Modern Slavery*, 2009).
- **80% women, 50% children** (TIP Report 2007)
- Source Countries: **Africa, Asia, India, Latin America, Eastern Europe, Russia and Canada.**
 - no country exempt
 - SAGE works with 30 – 60 int'l clients / year

situation happens, then a worse situation happens. And pretty soon these situations are built upon one another and that person is not able to think their way out of this situation. They are not able to think at all and they become traumatized. So you can see how trauma begins to take effect right there. And multiple traumas lead to PTSD, and lead to sort of an inability to really function in a way where you can see, know what is in your best interest anymore, because you are just surviving from one day to the next. It can be in a situation as horrible as the one we just, all of the situations are horrible in unique ways, and there is no situation more horrible than another. When trauma is involved, when a person has been traumatized, whether it is domestic or international, they all build; they have the same effects, the same effects upon the body, the same effects upon the soul and the person. So no trauma, no situation, no one is worse than another. Because the way we look at it is trauma is trauma, and, and it has long term, long lasting effects on individuals. Very, very hard to overcome, which we will talk a little bit more about.

We want to talk about the trends. This is the international human trafficking trends, and we think about these, these numbers are so big I really cannot comprehend them because 27 million people enslaved globally, 2 million children, 1.2 million children annually. These figures come from different places as you can see. This one is from UNICEF, 32 billion in annual profits for traffickers. We do know, I know this because it was said last night, what is the



Trends: International Human Trafficking

- **27 mil people** enslaved globally (Free the Slaves), **10 mil children**; **1.2 mil children** annually. (UNICEF)
- **\$32 bil** in annual profit for traffickers
(Kara, Siddharth. Sex Trafficking: Inside the Business of Modern Slavery, 2009).
- **80% women, 50% children** (TIP Report 2007)
- Source Countries: **Africa, Asia, India, Latin America, Eastern Europe, Russia and Canada.**
 - no country exempt
 - SAGE works with 30 – 60 int'l clients / year

whole purpose of this, why do the trafficker do this? Profits. And some people, our world is made up of many many different types of people obviously and for some people the importance of money and making a profit is more important than anything else. And that is, in the case of trafficking you are going to shut up some part of yourself in order to sell people. And we also know that trafficking is beginning to be up there with, surpassing almost drug sales because you can sell a person more than once. You cannot sell a drug more than once. So if I am selling some drugs, I can sell them one time but I can sell a person multiple times.

Source countries, we see trafficking coming from Africa, Asia, India, Latin America, Eastern Europe, Russia, Canada, it can be anywhere though. We will talk a little bit more when we talk about the sex industry in countries where prostitution is legal, in Amsterdam, people are still trafficked into Amsterdam, people are trafficked into Germany, where prostitution is legal. And there trafficked in from Eastern Europe, from Asia, from a variety of different countries. And the people, the women that are trafficked in into this sex industry there, it is in essence trafficking, and how they are treated, and the lack of supports for them in these countries, and we will talk more about that in a bit. But essentially, many people come in, also who are underage, but there is those elements of force, fraud, and coercion.



Trends: International Human Trafficking

- **27 mil people** enslaved globally (Free the Slaves), **10 mil children**; **1.2 mil children** annually. (UNICEF)
- **\$32 bil** in annual profit for traffickers
(Kara, Siddharth. *Sex Trafficking: Inside the Business of Modern Slavery*, 2009).
- **80% women, 50% children** (TIP Report 2007)
- Source Countries: **Africa, Asia, India, Latin America, Eastern Europe, Russia and Canada.**
 - no country exempt
 - SAGE works with 30 – 60 int'l clients / year

No country is exempt from human trafficking, and probably for us we work with SAGE with 30 to 60 international clients a year, although we do work, and predominantly our population is domestic, domestic women who have been involved in the sex industry, and domestic minor sex trafficking. But we also work with international clients who have been involved in labor. As Donna said this is very very complicated, the whole idea of the human trafficking, the law is very complicated. So when we look at why there are not more cases prosecuted in a year, say let's look at the state of California or the United States, why do we not see more trafficking cases prosecuted? A lot of it is because of the danger, and hopefully you can see the underground nature of this in our country, it is the same in other countries as well, but the nature of human trafficking is such that, you, a person who is trafficked does not necessarily feel safe in coming forward. By the law in California you have to testify against, or, during prosecution you have to be a part of the prosecution. And if you are a part of the prosecution there is lot of fear around that. So you know I think that this is a piece that we have to begin to look out and here in California, how do we address, how do we address that and, if you are a victim of domestic violence you do not have to prosecute your abuser, you do not have to be a part of the prosecution. But maybe that is something that needs to be looked at. But I think also that underground nature of fearing for your family, for children, loved ones, anyone who might be harmed that you are trying to protect. And the nature of trauma again, feeling that if you are unable to think your way out of this situation, how are you going to protect yourself or



Trends: International Human Trafficking

- **27 mil people** enslaved globally (Free the Slaves), **10 mil children**; **1.2 mil children** annually. (UNICEF)
- **\$32 bil** in annual profit for traffickers
(Kara, Siddharth. *Sex Trafficking: Inside the Business of Modern Slavery*, 2009).
- **80% women, 50% children** (TIP Report 2007)
- Source Countries: **Africa, Asia, India, Latin America, Eastern Europe, Russia and Canada.**
 - no country exempt
 - SAGE works with 30 – 60 int'l clients / year

other people, and how are your choices, so, it is going to be affected, including trust, when maybe the most trusted people have betrayed you.

One of the things we hear, and I think we hear this very regularly from the youth but also from adult women is that even with law enforcement, now maybe it is more of law, local law enforcement, it does not have to be related to local law enforcement but we often hear from youth that they have been forced, or from young adults, that they have been forced to have sex with the cop that arrested them. So this is not uncommon, unfortunately, and because that, if the very nature of people that are supposed to protect you are betraying you, or if you are taken into a shelter and nobody speaks your language and you feel that you are trapped there, then, those situations, even though there might be safety there, it is not going to feel that much different than the situation that you came out of. So trust is huge, a huge piece of this.